

RELIGIOUS TOLERATION AND DIVERSITY IN AMERICA, 1640-PRESENT

HISTORY 471R (Also PJST 475R and RLST 366R)

Spring 2015
MWF 1-1:50 p.m.
LA 230

Dr. Michael Goode
Phone: (801) 863-6358

Office: LA 012t
Office hours: MW 2-3 p.m. or
by appt.

Email: mgoode@uvu.edu (preferred)

Co-instructors: Dr. Michael Minch (MMinch@uvu.edu)
Office and hours: LA121 H; M-TH, 11:30-12:30
Dr. Brian Birch (Brian.Birch@uvu.edu)
Office and hours: By appt.

COURSE OBJECTIVES

This course examines the origins, development, and limits of religious toleration and diversity in America. The course is organized thematically and will consider toleration both theoretically and historically. Toleration was (and is) sometimes expressed as an ideal, but more often it emerged in tension with religious, ethnic, and racial diversity. Toleration rarely meant embracing diversity; more often, it meant the opposite – an inability to drive out the “strangers” in their midst forced laity, clergy, and state officials to accept, albeit very begrudgingly, religious and racial or ethnic pluralism. Paradoxically, then, *intolerance* shaped much of toleration in America (far more than “secularization,” as historians have previously assumed). Religious toleration was also championed as a legal principle, as in Pennsylvania and in the Establishment Clause of the United States Constitution. But whether toleration was institutionalized or not, there were always underlying articulations of power and order that served the interests of the “orthodox” (however defined) over those deemed outsider or heretical.

Required Texts:

Jon Butler, Grant Wacker, and Randall Balmer, *Religion in American Life: A Short History* (Oxford University Press, 2008) [**available as eBook at UVU library**]

John Corrigan and Lynn Neal, eds., *Religious Intolerance in America: A Documentary History* (University of North Carolina Press, 2010) [**available as eBook at UVU library**]

GRADE DISTRIBUTION

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. Participation – 20% | 4. Five Response Papers (1 pp. each) – 10% |
| 2. Primary Source Analysis (2-3 pp.) – 15% | 5. Religious Service Visit – 15% |
| 3. Presentation – 15% | 6. Final Exam – 25% |

This is an upper-level undergraduate seminar. The course emphasizes readings and in-class discussions. Your grade for this course will be based on your participation in class and

completion of written assignments. Papers should be reflective, free of grammatical errors, and clearly written. In addition to the written assignments, students will also be required to attend a religious service outside of class and make an oral presentation about their visit. The final exam will be a written take-home essay.

ASSIGNMENTS

Response Papers

Each week, students will have the opportunity to submit a one-page response paper consisting of 2-4 paragraphs (typed, single-spaced in MS Word) addressing: (1) the author's main argument and use of evidence and (2) connections with other readings, themes, and/or further questions raised by the text. Reading reports should focus on analysis. You will not get full credit for just summarizing the text. Students must submit a total of five response papers for the semester.

Response papers are due on the day they are assigned for class discussion and will be uploaded on Canvas for a grade.

Primary Source Analysis

Students will also write 1 primary source analysis paper consisting of 2-3 pages (typed, double-spaced, 1 inch margins in MS Word). You may choose from any of the primary sources assigned in the syllabus readings or from Corrigan and Neal, eds., *Religious Intolerance in America: A Documentary History*. There should be a minimum of 2 source documents in your paper. Primary Source Analysis papers must be analytical and draw from class discussions and assigned secondary texts. You may choose ANY week to do your primary source analysis paper, but it must be turned in on or before the last day of class, April 24.

Religious Service Visit and Presentation

Students will be required to visit one religious service outside of their own faith tradition (or alternately, if you have no religious affiliation, any religious service). You may conduct this visit individually or in groups with other students. On Week 10, students will give oral presentations in class about their visit.

COURSE OUTLINE AND READING ASSIGNMENTS

***Indicates readings will be on Canvas**

Week 1: INTRODUCTION: WHAT IS TOLERATION?

JAN 05	Class Introduction
JAN 07	What is Toleration?
JAN 09	*Evan Haefeli, "Toleration," <i>Religion Compass</i> 4/4 (2010): 253-262

Week 2: TOLERATION AND THE ENGLISH REVOLUTION

JAN 12	Locke on Toleration
--------	---------------------

- JAN 14 *John Coffey, "Religion," in Knoppers, ed., *The Oxford Handbook of Literature and the English Revolution* (Oxford, 2012), 98-117
- JAN 16 *John Miller, "A Suffering People: English Quakers and Their Neighbours c. 1650-c. 1700," *Past & Present* (August 2005): 71-103 **(RR)**
- PRIMARY John Locke, *A Letter Concerning Toleration* (1689)

Week 3: **CARIBBEAN**

- JAN 19 **NO CLASS – MLK DAY**
- JAN 21 Lecture on Atlantic Slavery and Caribbean
- JAN 23 *Kristen Block, *Ordinary Lives in the Caribbean* (2012), chapters 10-11 **(RR)**
- PRIMARY George Fox, *Gospel Family Order* (London, 1676)
http://tritych.brynmawr.edu/cdm/ref/collection/HC_QuakSlav/id/574

Week 4: **PURITAN NEW ENGLAND**

- JAN 26 Butler, etc., *Religion in American Life*, chapter 3
- JAN 28 *John Sweet, "Negotiating Slavery," in *Bodies Politic: Negotiating Race in the American North, 1730-1830* (2003), 58-64, 73-83 **(RR)**
- JAN 30 Primary Source Discussion
- PRIMARY The Sewall-Saffin Debate on Slavery
<http://nationalhumanitiescenter.org/pds/becomingamer/ideas/text3/slaverychristian.pdf>

Week 5: **PENNSYLVANIA**

- FEB 02 Butler, etc., *Religion in American Life*, chapter 4
- FEB 04 *Andrew Murphy, "Persecuting Quakers? Liberty and Toleration in Early America," in *The First Prejudice: Religious Tolerance and Intolerance in Early America* (2011), 143-165 **(RR)**
- FEB 06 Primary Source Discussion
- PRIMARY William Penn, *Frame of Government* (1681); Thomas Budd, *A Testimony and Caution ... [against] Worldly Government* (1692); George Keith, *An Exhortation & Caution to Friends Concerning Buying or Keeping of Negroes* (1693)

Week 6: **NATIVE AMERICANS**

- FEB 09 Peter Silver, "The Seven Years War and the White People" in *Our Savage Neighbors* (2008), 95-123 **(RR)**

FEB 11 Primary Source Discussion
FEB 13 **NO CLASS – Reading Day**

PRIMARY “The Apology of the Paxton Volunteers,” in *Major Problems in American Colonial History* (2012); Anthony Benezet, “An Account of a Visit Lately Made to the People Called Quakers in Philadelphia, By Papoonahol,” (1760)

Week 7: BLACK ATLANTIC

FEB 16 **NO CLASS –Washington Lincoln Day**
FEB 18 Philip Morgan, “British Encounters with Africans and African-Americans, 1600-1780” in *Strangers in the Realm: Cultural Margins of the First British Empire* (1991), 157-219 (**RR**)
FEB 20 Minch – Root of Toleration (TBA)

Week 8: GREAT AWAKENINGS

FEB 23 Butler, etc., *Religion in American Life*, chapter 6
FEB 25 Catherine Brekus, *Strangers & Pilgrims: Female Preaching in America, 1740-1845* (1998), 23-67 (**RR**)
FEB 27 Primary Source Discussion
PRIMARY Documents from “Religious Awakenings,” in *Major Problems in American Colonial History* (2012)

Samuel Hopkins, *The Life and Character of Miss Susannah Anthony* (London, 1803):

<https://archive.org/stream/lifecharacterofm00anth#page/56/mode/2up>

Week 9: AMERICAN REVOLUTIONS

MAR 02 Lecture on American Revolution
MAR 04 Benjamin Irvin, *Clothed in Robes of Sovereignty: The Continental Congress and the People Out of Doors* (2011), chapter 5 (**RR**)
MAR 06 Primary Source Discussion
PRIMARY Pacifist Appeals in the American Revolution:
<http://americainclass.org/sources/makingrevolution/rebellion/text5/religiouspacifists.pdf>

Week 10: FOUNDING FATHERS

MAR 09 **David Sehat, “Contested Liberties,” in *The Myth of American Religious Freedom* (Oxford, 2011), 13-30

MAR 11 ** Sehat, "A Godless Government?," in *Myth of American Religious Freedom*, 31-50

MAR 13 **Sehat, "The Moral Establishment," in *Myth of American Religious Freedom*, 50-70 (RR)

Week 11: **MORMONISM**

MAR 16 Butler, *Religion in American Life*, Chapters 9 and 11

MAR 18 Marvin Hill, "An Appeal to Higher Power" in *Quest for Refuge: The Mormon Flight from American Pluralism*" (1989)

MAR 20 Sarah Barringer Gordon, "The Twin Relics of Barbarism" in *The Mormon Question: Polygamy and Constitutional Conflict in Nineteenth-Century America* (2002)

Week 12: **MORMONISM PART TWO**

MAR 23 Noah Feldman, "What is It About Mormonism" in *The New York Times Magazine* (2008)

MAR 25 Damon Linker, "The Big Test" in *The New Republic* (2007)

MAR 27 "Bridging the Divide: Pain and Hurt in Open Dialogue" Salt Lake City Mayor's Task Force Report (2006)

Week 13: **ORAL PRESENTATIONS**

MAR 30 Individual/Group Presentations on Religious Services

APR 01 Individual/Group Presentations on Religious Services

APR 03 Individual/Group Presentations on Religious Services

Week 14: **NO CLASS SPRING BREAK**

Week 15: **MORMONISM PART TWO**

APR 13 Liberal Sources of Toleration (TBA)

APR 15 Republican Sources of Toleration (TBA)

APR 17 Christian Sources of Toleration (TBA)

Week 16: **SEPTEMBER 11**

APR 20 Martha Nussbaum, *The New Religious Tolerance: Overcoming the Politics of Fear in an Anxious Age* (2012)

APR 22 Wendell Berry, *Thoughts in the Presence of Fear* (2001)

APR 24 Conclusions

FINAL EXAM DUE ON CANVAS BY 5 P.M. APRIL 30